

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

OF WEST VIRGINIA

CHARLESTON

* * * * *

MONONGAHELA POWER COMPANY and*

THE POTOMAC EDISON COMPANY * 17-0296-E-PC

*

* * * * *

HEARING TRANSCRIPT

* * * * *

BEFORE: BROOKS MCCABE, JR.,

Commissioner

HEARING: Monday, September 11, 2017

7:04 p.m.

LOCATION: Martinsburg City Building

Municipal Courtroom

232 North Queen Street, 1st Floor

Martinsburg WV

Reporter: Guy Starrett

Any reproduction of this transcript
is prohibited without authorization
by the certifying agency.

A P P E A R A N C E S

1

2

3 JACK E. CLARK, II, ESQUIRE

4 Public Service Commission of West Virginia

5 201 Brooks Street

6 P.O. Box 812

7 Charleston, WV 25323

8 Counsel for the Public Service Commission

9

10 TOM WHITE, ESQUIRE

11 Consumer Advocate Division

12 700 Union Building

13 723 Kanawha Boulevard, East

14 Charleston, WV 25301

15 Counsel for the Consumer Advocate Division

16

17 GARY JACK, ESQUIRE

18 HOLLY KAUFMAN, ESQUIRE

19 FirstEnergy

20 5001 NASA Boulevard

21 Fairmont, WV 26554

22 Counsel for the Monongahela Power Company and The

23 Potomac Edison Company

24

25

INDEX TO WITNESSES

1		
2		
3	DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES	6 - 12
4	PUBLIC COMMENT	
5	By Eric Householder	12 - 14
6	By Larry Wolfe	14 - 15
7	By Helen Henderson	15
8	By Ian Henderson	16
9	By George Powell	16 - 18
10	By Lynette Buckley	18 - 19
11	By Richard Lateral	19 - 21
12	By Patience Wait	21 - 23
13	By Danny Chiotos	23 - 26
14	By Karen Newman	26 - 28
15	By Kery Fries	28 - 32
16	By Lynn Yellott	33 - 35
17	By Natalie Stone	35
18	By Jim Whitaker	36
19	By Edward Zahniser	36 - 38
20	By Regina Hendrix	38 - 40
21	By Rebecca Fibst	40 - 41
22	By Mandy Staffa	41 - 44
23	By Robert Fernatt	44 - 45
24	By Eileen Curfman	45 - 46
25	By Cecil Claude	46 - 48

1	INDEX TO WITNESSES (cont'd)	
2		
3	PUBLIC COMMENT	
4	By Craig Blair	48 - 50
5	By Charlotte Brown	51
6	By Danny Lutz	51 - 54
7	By Douglas Copenhaver	54 - 56
8	By John Rosenberger	56
9	By Chris Craig	57 - 59
10	By Tracey Cannon	59 - 62
11	By Consuelo Newman	62 - 66
12	By Maggie Loudin	66 - 68
13	By Barbara Bergman	68 - 70
14	By Jane Butler	70 - 72
15	By Claudia Orr	72 - 73
16	By Walter Duke	73 - 74
17	By Helen Grisell	74 - 76
18	DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES	76 - 80
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

E X H I B I T S

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

<u>Number</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Page Offered</u>
	<u>Public Comments</u>	
1	Regina Hendrix's Statement	--
2	John Doyle's Statement	--

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

Let's start the comment hearing. I'm Commissioner McCabe for the West Virginia Public Service Commission. We'd like to make a quick announcement and that is the doors all around me up here to the right and behind me, please don't enter or exit them. Other business in this building is being carried on there.

We've got our courtroom entrance, so if you'd enter and leave from the main entrance I believe the other folks that work in the building would --- would appreciate it. We're here this evening to take public comment in Case Number 170296-E-PC, which is our case caption Monongahela Power Company and Potomac Edison Company, petition for approval of generation resource transactions and related relief.

This case involves a proposal filed by Monongahela Power and Potomac Edison for consent and approval to purchase the Pleasants power station from AE Supply for \$195 billion. The companies have requested a temporary transaction surcharge to be implemented at the closing of the transaction.

If the transaction is approved, that would remain in place until the new base rates are

1 implemented. In addition to that surcharge, the
2 company's proposing offsetting ENC increase until the
3 next ENC ---.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:

5 We can't hear you at all.

6 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

7 I --- I apologize. I'll try to stand
8 up. This room is --- it's difficult from the --- from
9 that perspective. If approved the Companies seek ---
10 seek rates to be implemented at the closing that will
11 result in a net decrease of 1.6 percent and the rate by
12 the offset of the surcharge with the expected ENC
13 decrease.

14 The Commission granted intervenor
15 status to the Consumer Advocate Division, the West
16 Virginia Energy Users Group, the West Virginia Solar
17 United Neighborhood, West Virginia Citizens Action Group,
18 Longview Power, LLC, the Sierra Club, Harrison County
19 Power, LLC, Brooke County Power, LLC and the West
20 Virginia Business Industrial --- Industry Council.

21 To date this case has received
22 approximately 995 signatures in protest of the transfer
23 and 36 signatures in support. Those --- those have been
24 from petitioners, faxed letters, online letters and ---
25 or form letters. Remember, this is not an evidentiary

1 hearing. It is a public comment hearing and we are here
2 to listen to your comments. This is not, however, the
3 time or place to ask questions of the representatives of
4 the parties on record.

5 If you wish to ask questions we believe
6 the Commission Staff and utility representatives here
7 tonight will be willing to answer your questions on an
8 informal basis after the comment period. Also be aware
9 that Monongahela Power Company, Potomac Edison Company
10 have customer assistance representatives to discuss any
11 billing problems or other inquiries not related to the
12 Pleasants power plant proposal. See the representatives
13 just out the door to the left sitting on the bench if you
14 need any type of assistance in that regard.

15 At this time I'm going to have the
16 counsel for the parties that are present to introduce
17 themselves. Monongahela Power and Potomac Edison.

18 ATTORNEY JACK:

19 Thank you, Commissioner McCabe. Good
20 evening, everyone. My name is Gary Jack. I'm counsel to
21 the Potomac Edison Company and Mon Power. And with me
22 this evening is Holly Kaufman. She is the President of
23 the West Virginia operations for both Potomac Edison and
24 Mon Power. Thank you very much.

25 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

1 Staff?

2 ATTORNEY CLARK:

3 Good evening, everyone. My name is
4 Jack Clark. I am a Staff attorney with the Commission's
5 legal division and as Commissioner McCabe noted, I'll
6 make myself available afterwards to try to answer any
7 questions that anyone might have.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

9 Consumer Advocate Division?

10 ATTORNEY WHITE:

11 Hello, everybody. Thank you for
12 coming. My name is Tom White. I'm a lawyer with the
13 Consumer Advocate Division. We are charged with
14 representing the interest of residential ratepayers in
15 cases like this. So I will be available as well if there
16 are any questions I can help you with.

17 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

18 If you've already filed a written
19 protest that is the same and just as good as making a
20 statement at this hearing and you're not required to make
21 another statement to be considered by the Commission.
22 Filing a written protest, however, does not prevent you
23 from making statements this evening. If you spoke at the
24 Parkersburg hearing, there is no need to speak here
25 again. If someone cannot attend tonight we are having

1 another public hearing tomorrow night in Morgantown.

2 Remember, however, we are only taking
3 public comments from members of the public. If you are a
4 member of a group that is an intervenor in this case, you
5 will not be allowed to make comments this evening because
6 of your status as --- as a participant to the intervenor.

7 We have a large crowd this evening and
8 we want to hear from you, and I would like to say that we
9 are very sensitive as the room is not big enough for the
10 crowd. And for that I --- I apologize personally. This
11 is what was available. There's other things going on
12 here in the community and this --- this was the room that
13 we were able to get. With that aside, we apologize for
14 not having a larger room.

15 We ask that you silence or turn off
16 your cell phones. If you get a call that you must take
17 or feel you need to make a call, please leave the hearing
18 room before beginning to take the call. We want to hear
19 from as many as possible who would like to speak, but
20 please be brief and concise as you possibly can. We
21 would like to limit your comments to about three minutes
22 so we have time to let everyone speak. In the course of
23 the evening it is necessary --- if it is necessary to ask
24 a particular person to shorten comments, we will try to
25 accommodate that person at the end of the evening.

1 This is your court reporter to my left.
2 The court reporter has a very difficult job. The court
3 reporter must record every word that is spoken today.
4 The reporter doesn't type the words, as you may have seen
5 on TV, the reporter repeats everything that is said along
6 with who said it and the mask room is recorded.
7 Obviously, the recorder can't take comments by more than
8 one person at a time and can't transcribe proceedings
9 while others are talking. In the short time that we have
10 for --- in the short time that we have for speakers, we
11 really want to make sure that everybody gets their chance
12 to talk. You know, we're not really interested in
13 applause. You know, we're interested in listening to
14 hear what the speakers have to say. That's why we're
15 here.

16 This is --- this is a public comment
17 and everybody who wants to speak should get a chance to
18 --- to say their piece. I will call names on the list.
19 When you hear your name please come forward and right ---
20 right here in front and give your full name, spell your
21 last name even --- even if it is a relatively simple
22 name.

23 We will then proceed with your
24 statement, but please keep it within the time limit.
25 Speak clearly so the rest of the people in the room can

1 hear and also so the court reporter can record what you
2 --- what you are saying. If you have not signed up and
3 wish to speak, please raise your hand and Susan Steward
4 in front here will try to --- try to get your name and
5 put you on the sign-up sheet. We have several elected
6 --- elected officials. If their schedule is tight and
7 they need to speak sooner rather than later, let us know.

8 And with that, we will start with ---
9 the first sign up is Delegate Householder.

10 DELEGATE HOUSEHOLDER:

11 Eric Householder,
12 H-O-U-S-E-H-O-L-D-E-R. Good evening, Commissioner and
13 --- and thank you for having this public forum, and ---
14 and thank you for allowing us --- allowing me to address
15 the PSC and to voice my support for the Pleasants power
16 plant transaction. As stated, I'm Delegate Eric
17 Householder and I represent the 64th Delegate District
18 here in Berkeley County since 2010.

19 As Vice Chairman of the House Finance
20 Committee, I have an up close and personal view on every
21 detail in the state budget. I value every individual
22 taxpayer in West Virginia and I want to keep the
23 businesses we have and, of course, I want to grow our
24 economy whenever we can. I've reviewed the information
25 filed with the PSC about --- about this case and the

1 critical details as I see them, rest with whether the
2 Pleasants power plant will continue to operate.

3 Right now this plant --- this plant
4 burns West Virginia coal and it employs about 240 people
5 at the plant, and it supports countless other West
6 Virginia businesses. Pleasants is a merchant power
7 plant, so the power it generates goes directly to the
8 grid, not just to West Virginians. FirstEnergy, the
9 parent company, has said it is leaving the competitive
10 energy business in the next couple of years.

11 So even though Pleasants is a world
12 class facility, it likely will be deactivated unless
13 someone buys it. At the same time Mon Power needs to
14 secure enough capacity to meet growth projections for the
15 next decade or longer. So this purchase clearly makes a
16 lot of sense.

17 I want to add something else. I'm a
18 small business owner here in Martinsburg and I imagine
19 there are a lot of small businesses out there that
20 service the Pleasants plant in some way. Now, if this
21 transaction is denied and the plant closes, some of those
22 companies might not be able to stay in business. I don't
23 want that to begin to --- I don't want to begin to
24 imagine what would happen to West Virginia if we lose
25 even more businesses, take away even more coal

1 production, lose more tax revenue and ultimately add more
2 people to our unemployment roles.

3 Now, all this can be avoided by
4 allowing this purchase to take place and the PSC clearly
5 will be serving in the public's best interest by
6 approving this transaction. Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

8 Thank you, sir. Larry Wolfe.

9 MR. WOLFE:

10 Good evening, Commissioner. My name's
11 Larry Wolfe, W-O-L-F-E. I'm President for the Western
12 Maryland Building of Construction Trades Council and also
13 Secretary/Treasurer for Teamster Joint Council 62. I
14 represent approximately 12,000 working families in the
15 four state area.

16 We support good economic development
17 projects throughout this country, our state and region
18 and we support a broad energy policy including coal,
19 natural gas, nuclear, solar and wind. Currently our
20 Trade Council has many construction members working on
21 the Proctor and Gamble site just south of here and a
22 variety of other projects in Berkeley County and
23 throughout our region.

24 These jobs as well as the energy
25 construction and maintenance projects provide good paying

1 jobs for working families in our region. The PNG plant,
2 natural gas production and other economic development
3 projects throughout the state and region are creating an
4 increased need for energy production over time.

5 We believe the in state production of
6 energy is good for our state, our citizens and for our
7 businesses. I ask you to please keep these facts in mind
8 when considering this application.

9 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

10 Thank you, sir. Helen Henderson. And
11 I apologize if I mess any names up.

12 MS. HENDERSON:

13 Yes, my name is Helen Henderson. I
14 live at 211 Westbrook Street, Martinsburg, West Virginia.
15 I strongly protest the suggested purchase of Pleasants
16 power station. At a time when energy companies are
17 turning to renewable sources of energy this is not the
18 time to continue supporting a plant which is harmful to
19 the environment.

20 Burdening West Virginia taxpayers with
21 the possibility of subsidizing a plant so that the
22 shareholders can be assured of a profit makes no sense.
23 I therefore protest this purchase first on an
24 environmental grounds as well as fiscal ones. Thank you.

25 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

1 Thank you. Ian Henderson. What I'm
2 going to do to speed things along is also announce the
3 next name. So if you're in the back of the room you can
4 work your way forward and that would be George Powell
5 after Mr. Henderson.

6 MR. HENDERSON:

7 Ian Henderson, H-E-N-D-E-R-S-O-N, Burke
8 Street, Martinsburg. I'm opposed to this proposition.
9 It seems absurd for a profit organization selling a
10 profitable arm doesn't really make any sense to me. Now,
11 I've not gone into the granularity of the deal, but I've
12 read the summaries of those who have and I'm --- and I
13 really sided on the independent whereby this is not in
14 the service of West Virginia.

15 This is not a good deal for West
16 Virginia. I'm very sympathetic to those who potentially
17 lose jobs, but to look at coal as a solution to economic
18 development is beyond my comprehension. It is not the
19 future of economic development in this country. It's ---
20 it's backward. Thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

22 Thank you, sir. George Powell. The
23 next one up is --- is Lynette Buckley.

24 MR. POWELL:

25 My name is George Powell and I live at

1 448 Universe Drive in Martinsburg. I also split my time
2 between here and Texas, and before I moved to --- to West
3 Virginia I'd never seen electricity so high any place
4 that I've lived. And I've lived in New Mexico, Arizona
5 and Texas. And even now I go back and forth to El Paso
6 and I pay half of what I pay here for electricity, and
7 this plant that we're talking about in 2006 ---.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

9 Sir, could you speak up a little,
10 please?

11 MR. POWELL:

12 Oh. In 2006 they had CO2 emissions of
13 7,992,029 tons, and sulfur dioxide emissions of 42,867
14 tons, and nitrous oxide emissions of 9,512 tons and
15 mercury emissions in 2005 of 328 pounds. These are
16 environmental factors that kill 13,000 people a year in
17 this country from power plants.

18 There's a --- there's a tremendous
19 human cost to these coal power --- coal-fired plants and
20 we have to --- to move into a direction that has cleaner
21 energy for our people, for our children, for our
22 grandchildren. I don't think that we're going to survive
23 another five generations on this planet the way we are
24 proceeding with our environment and our world.

25 And so I --- I totally protest buying a

1 --- a failing plant and then for us to bail it out and
2 pay more in electricity when we should be moving in
3 another direction. And we should be retraining people to
4 move in that direction. Thank you.

5 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

6 Thank you, sir. We don't need to clap
7 so we can move it along. We have both for and against
8 here. The important thing is what people say. After
9 Lynette Buckley we have Richard Lateral.

10 MS. BUCKLEY:

11 Hello. Lynette Buckley, B-U-C-K-L-E-Y.
12 Thank you for allowing me to address the PSC today. My
13 name is Lynette Buckley. My husband and I own Randy's
14 Contracting Service in Romney, West Virginia. We are a
15 general contracting company that employs 27 and also we
16 are a longtime vendor of Mon Power.

17 We know that they're a great company
18 that provides good jobs to a lot of people and allows
19 small businesses, like ours, to stay in business. I
20 encourage --- encourage the Public Service Commission to
21 approve Mon Power's purchase of the Pleasants power
22 station because it will provide more than 200 jobs at the
23 plant along with hundreds of other jobs supporting
24 businesses in West Virginia.

25 As a business owner, I also know how

1 important it is to have affordable electricity. This ---
2 with this transaction, Mon Power will not only be
3 securing reliable electric power for its customers for
4 years to come, it will also be able to lower rates
5 slightly for homeowners and businesses. In a challenging
6 economy like West Virginia we need everything --- every
7 little bit will help us every way it can.

8 It makes perfect sense to me to allow
9 Mon Power to pay --- to buy Pleasants power company and
10 add it to its business utilities. Workers will benefit,
11 customers will benefit, West Virginia will benefit.
12 Please approve this transaction. Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

14 Next up is Richard Lateral and he will
15 also be reading a statement from Delegate Doyle.
16 Following Mr. Lateral will be Patience Wait I believe.
17 Yes, sir.

18 MR. LATERAL:

19 I'm Richard Lateral, resident of
20 Shepherdstown.

21 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

22 Could you speak up, sir, if you could?

23 MR. LATERAL:

24 Yes. My name is Richard Lateral. I'm
25 a resident of Shepherdstown. I'm a professor of biology

1 at Shepherd College. I've been asked to read a
2 communication from John --- John Doyle, a longtime member
3 of the House of Delegates in the State of West Virginia
4 who couldn't be here tonight. So he asked me to pinch
5 hit for him.

6 Mr. Doyle's comments are as follows.
7 To members of the Public Service Commission, please do
8 not permit the sale of the Pleasants County power plant
9 by FirstEnergy to Potomac Edison. To do so would be to
10 expose the ratepayers of Potomac Edison to an additional
11 financial responsibility they do not deserve.

12 Under the circumstances --- under no
13 circumstances should the customers of Potomac Edison in
14 Jefferson County or those of any other community served
15 by Potomac Edison be subjected to this grossly unfair
16 added expense. Gratefully yours, John Doyle.

17 If I might add some comments of my own
18 parenthetically. This sale would be a mistake, a grave
19 mistake. What it represents is an attempt to leap back
20 into the past back when coal was king in West Virginia.
21 That's simply going in the wrong direction. What they
22 should be doing is keeping our sites trained on the
23 future and the future for West Virginia and for the rest
24 of the nation is the renewable sources of energy. The
25 most appealing of which is solar energy, which is

1 currently replacing coal at a great rate for production
2 of electricity all over the State of West Virginia.

3 And in the process it's creating jobs
4 faster than is coal, natural gas or any of the other
5 fossil fuels. So let's set our sights on the future and
6 proceed hence rather than looking over our shoulders and
7 imagine past glories.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

9 Thank you, sir.

10 MR. LATERAL:

11 Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

13 Patience Wait. And the next person is
14 Daniel Chiotos.

15 MS. WAIT:

16 Chiotos (corrects pronunciation).

17 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

18 Chiotos. Thank you.

19 MS. WAIT:

20 My name is Patience Wait. I live in
21 Shepherdstown. This is a case of need, but this is not
22 about West Virginian's needs. This is about First
23 Energy's needs, you know, the need to keep shareholders
24 happy. You know, that they actually told financial
25 analysts in a conference call that they were going to do

1 this months before they filed the application with the
2 Public Service Commission. The Harrison plant was such a
3 great success for them they said, we're going to do it
4 with Pleasants, too.

5 And this is about the need to boost
6 executive compensation because after all the executives
7 don't get their big bonus packages if the shareholders
8 aren't happy. Do you know that FirstEnergy is paying \$6
9 million a year for gaming lights for a professional
10 football stadium? And this is about the need to cover up
11 its bad business plan.

12 In Ohio it was supposed to be a
13 competitive market and FirstEnergy jumped in and lo and
14 behold, they discovered that they were losing money. And
15 so they said, well, we'll get this plant transferred over
16 into a regulated market so that we don't have to eat the
17 costs, taxpayers will, ratepayers will. That has nothing
18 to with West Virginia's needs.

19 You know, when citizens come to the
20 government it's called all kinds of terrible things. You
21 know, welfare, and hand out, and bailout, and crutch and
22 the citizens get called terrible names when they ask, you
23 know, like lazy, and moocher, and leech. So why in the
24 world would we reward FirstEnergy for its short
25 sightedness and its fear of competition?

1 I would also say to the Commissioner
2 this is the Public Service Commission. That's the
3 public. That is --- yes, you regulate businesses, but it
4 is all of the citizens of West Virginia and service means
5 in service of that public. So please as you are taking
6 this on remember it. Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

8 Thank you. Mr. Chiotos and Karen
9 Newman is next up.

10 MR. CHIOTOS:

11 Hi. My name is Danny Chiotos.

12 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

13 Spell it, sir.

14 MR. CHIOTOS:

15 C-H --- no worries. It's a weird one.
16 Rhymes with Otis. C-H-I-O-T-O-S. I live in Bolivar,
17 West Virginia with my wife and three kids, and six
18 chickens and a whole bunch of other stuff. I am ---
19 tonight I'm representing the environment caucus chair for
20 the Jefferson County branch of the National Association
21 for the Advancement of Colored --- Colored People, NAACP.

22 So I'm reading a statement that we
23 drafted. This is our position on the transfer. The
24 Jefferson County branch of the NAACP firmly opposes the
25 transfer of the Pleasants coal-fired power plant into Mon

1 Power and Potomac Edison ownership. This is an
2 unnecessary step that puts this liability onto our power
3 bills and puts us at long term risk of the kind of rate
4 increases that resulted from the Harrison power station
5 transfer.

6 Our branch wants to see our electric
7 utility reduce their pollution, provide clean electricity
8 and ensure we can afford to keep the lights on. Our
9 branch urges you, the Public Service Commission --- and
10 thank you Commissioner McCabe for coming up here --- to
11 reject FirstEnergy's request as it will saddle ratepayers
12 with an uncompetitive coal plant that is a mismatch for
13 the evolving direction of the electric grid.

14 Coal plants and other baseload power
15 sources are having trouble competing across the nation as
16 more flexible power sources and demand management program
17 grow. This is the wrong time to purchase an
18 uncompetitive power plant and we call on our electric
19 utility to look forward instead of backwards to provide
20 affordable, clean and reliable power.

21 Our branch calls for the serious
22 prioritization of job creating energy efficiency and
23 renewable energy programs from our electric utility. We
24 see opportunities and serious programs that help people,
25 especially low and middle income people reduce their

1 electric use. We appreciate the energy efficiency
2 programs that are available through Potomac Edison, but
3 we call for their expansion.

4 Why is Potomac Edison not utilizing on
5 bill financing programs that helps us ratepayers afford
6 energy upgrades to our homes? Why is Potomac Edison not
7 providing incentives for ratepayers to reduce power use
8 in peak demand times? Why does Potomac Edison advertise
9 Energy Star products on their website, but leave
10 ratepayers in the cold with no rebates to incentivize the
11 purchase of these products?

12 Why does access to energy efficiency
13 programs grow exponentially when you cross that river and
14 get into Potomac Edison's Maryland territory instead of
15 its West Virginia territory where all of us live?
16 Utilities across the country are looking to renewable
17 energy, energy storage and demand management programs to
18 benefit ratepayers and build a smarter power grid.

19 Of the workers of this coal plant, if
20 it goes out of business through no fault of their own,
21 lose their jobs if it does happen, there should be a
22 robust pathway to alternative employment. As our
23 electric grid changes there --- we must be sincere in our
24 desire for employment and need for those --- and the need
25 for those workers to put food on their family's table.

1 There must be a transition plan in place for these
2 workers. The Jefferson County branch of the NAACP calls
3 on you to reject this transfer. Thank you.

4 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

5 Thank you, sir.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:

7 I second that.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

9 And, again, we don't need the --- the
10 clapping either for or against. We're --- we're most
11 interested in the comments of the folks that have taken
12 the time to come here. We got Karen Newman up now and
13 Kery Fries --- Frost is next up. Yes, ma'am.

14 MS. NEWMAN:

15 Hi. My name is Karen Newman. I am a
16 Potomac Edison ratepayer. Back in 2013 I spoke at a
17 public hearing against the Harrison transfer that
18 promised me lower rates. However, it's cost me \$130 so
19 far just me personally.

20 Now Mon Power wants --- back during the
21 Harrison transfer Mon Power bought --- Mon Power, excuse
22 me, sold Pleasants, sold an eight percent share of
23 Pleasants to AE Supply and now they're going to buy it
24 back. So this kind of bought and sold among FirstEnergy
25 affiliates is necessary to generate cash for FirstEnergy?

1 And I wonder, if energy prices recover will FirstEnergy
2 want to buy this plant back again?

3 Tonight I've heard a bunch of
4 ratepayers speak out about this. None of them said that
5 they want to pay more for energy in order to own this
6 plant. However, I heard some people speak in favor of
7 this deal and I wonder how would they benefit? And I do
8 want to thank you for coming here and listening to the
9 ratepayers, but do the voices of the ratepayers even
10 matter?

11 Can we have any influence upon a
12 corrupt system and a tone deaf PSC that only pretends to
13 listen? I'm just one small voice tonight. Utilities are
14 a big voice. They're loud, they're in your face every
15 day. Utilities strive to keep regulators captured and
16 sheltered from the outside influence anything other than
17 what the utilities want you to hear. Regulators are only
18 allowed to see what the utilities want them to see.
19 Captive regulators are reactive and they dance to the
20 utility's beat.

21 When will our PSC become a proactive
22 regulator acting in the best interest of West Virginians?
23 When will the PSC demonstrate leadership on our energy
24 and utility issues? A PSC that is not proactive on
25 policy and leadership is meekly led along like a dog on a

1 leash, unable to do more than react to utility proposals
2 that get more bold and outrageous as time goes on.

3 Don't let the utilities lead on policy.
4 Become a leader, do what is right for consumers, not what
5 is right for corporate fat cats in Akron, Ohio. Your job
6 isn't to balance my needs with the needs of FirstEnergy.
7 That's a passive and reactive stance. Be an assertive
8 leader acting in the public interest. I ask you to deny
9 FirstEnergy's request for another West Virginia ratepayer
10 bailout.

11 Don't sit passively secretly hoping
12 that some other regulator will step up and be the bad guy
13 who stops this underhanded deal. It isn't always popular
14 to say no, but sometimes you have to be the buzzkill and
15 act responsibly. Just say no.

16 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

17 Thank you. Next up is Kery Fries with
18 Lynn Yellott I think is following. Yes, sir.

19 MR. FRIES:

20 Mr. McCabe, my name is Kery,
21 K-E-R-Y, Fries, F-R-I-E-S. I'm here today to speak
22 against the proposal because I don't think it's going to
23 be good for the ratepayers of West Virginia. And
24 although sympathetic to the tradesmen and the union guys,
25 I think there's just as many or more jobs may be lost due

1 to the increase in prices to the small businesses. Mr.
2 --- Mr. McCabe, as you know, your mission is to support a
3 utility regulatory environment that balances interest of
4 all parties.

5 In your vision statement you express
6 that consumers shall receive the best value. To be
7 honest with you, sir, I think that the Public Service
8 Commission is woefully lacking. I think they have done a
9 horrible job. I think they express they did a horrible
10 job ---.

11 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

12 Can you speak up so everyone can hear
13 you?

14 MR. FRIES:

15 I think they did a horrible job with
16 the Harrison plant. They sold it to their cousin for
17 \$500 million more than it was worth and they allege ---
18 even the Public Service Commission's announcement alleged
19 it was a savings of \$16 million, but what really happened
20 it was a \$660 million debacle so far.

21 So one of two things is expressly
22 present. Either this Commission is not really competent
23 or this Commission has to be complicit because I know
24 there is no way that you don't understand \$160 million
25 difference. The Commission reports \$16 million of sale

1 as a first year benefit to the taxpayers. That was shown
2 in the County Trade. We all know that. Why am I here at
3 all, sir?

4 Because I was standing in the line at
5 the grocery store and in that line was a lady --- elderly
6 lady with her kid and she was stressing. And she says, I
7 can't afford my electric bill or my drugs. What should I
8 do? And I thought to myself, is this extra \$1,600 that's
9 proposed worth it?

10 It sounds to me like some of these
11 parties who basically go out and do the UNICEF fund \$5 a
12 day, \$5 a day, just \$5 more dollars a day, just \$5 more
13 dollars a month, just \$69 more dollars a year. It's a
14 problem and you don't say no. This Public Service
15 Commission is in need of reform. You need to go to five
16 Commissioners to deplete the power from Commissioner
17 Albert. You need to have public voting for the Public
18 Service Commission.

19 I don't blame any of the blue shirt
20 gentlemen back here. They're doing what they're supposed
21 to do. They will monopolize as much money as they can
22 get. They're not the problem. You're the problem
23 because you allow it to happen over and over. I watch
24 your decisions. It's 50 cents on the dollar. Every time
25 they ask for \$300 million they want \$150 you give them

1 \$150 and act like it was a great deal for everybody.
2 It's not.

3 Once in a while you have to say no.
4 And this plant --- now, it's my understanding that not
5 only do they want to buy this plant, but in order to
6 create a false shortage they must sell back the Virginia
7 plant. So you buy and sell. Where's the shortage? If
8 there's no shortage in 2027, why you got to do something
9 2017? It's premature. It doesn't need to be done. It
10 doesn't need to be done now.

11 Take the parties whose rates have gone
12 up significantly since FirstEnergy bought this company,
13 but it wasn't like that with Allegheny Power. It was
14 not. The burden of proof? The burden of proof should be
15 very severe. Why? Because when you allege it's going to
16 save you \$16 million and it costs you \$160 million, the
17 burden of proof on the gentlemen back there asserting
18 this plan ought to be even to the criminal standard
19 beyond a reasonable doubt because there's just no way
20 they don't know what it was.

21 And there's no way you couldn't have
22 known what it was going to cost and there's no way you
23 might do it again. Do I feel sympathetic to coal?
24 Absolutely. Coal is right. There's 240 people I feel
25 for tremendously, but for the 240 that lost --- and I

1 respect the union. The problem is simple. For those 240
2 lose how many people --- how many businesses have to
3 increase their cost of their electric if they can't
4 afford it?

5 Cathy Kunkel said it was \$6,000 per
6 commercial business and she said that as an i.e. Where's
7 that money coming from? Your Honor, the RFP, I could
8 create a hell of an RFP for myself for a job opportunity.
9 Fifty-three (53) year old man, West Virginia University,
10 WVU, John Marshall, George Washington University, 24
11 years of government experience.

12 I can do a heck of a RFP for myself.
13 If you create your own RFP, it's kind of easy. Bet you
14 won't have any competitors when you narrow the RFP so
15 closely that no one else can do it. The shortfall it's
16 late, it's premature. It's a fall shortage. Take it
17 into consideration. You're going to do what you're going
18 to do.

19 I don't know anything here that's going
20 to change your mind, but I respectfully think that you
21 should think about every one of those women in that line
22 who's worrying about their drug prices, and their
23 medicine and their electric prices and which one they can
24 afford. Thank you.

25 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

1 Thank you, sir. Next is Lynn Yellott
2 who will be followed by Natalie Stone.

3 MS. YELLOTT:

4 My name is Lynn Yellott. It's
5 Y-E-L-L-O-T-T. I'm also speaking on behalf of my
6 husband, Chesley Yellott, who couldn't attend tonight.
7 We live in Jefferson County, outside of Shepherdstown and
8 therefore are customers of Potomac Edison. In the
9 strongest possible terms we urge you not to approve the
10 sale of the coal-fired plant to --- to us ratepayers.

11 You have the testimony of David
12 Schlitzel whose credentials as an expert are impeccable.
13 He outlines the flaw of FirstEnergy's proposal, their RFP
14 and their claims. The bottom line is that the Ohio
15 company is accountable to its stockholders. They exist
16 to make profit for the ---.

17 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

18 Could you speak up so the folks behind
19 you could better hear?

20 MS. YELLOTT:

21 But they should not do that through a
22 subsidy --- subsidy derived from West Virginia
23 ratepayers. As Dr. Schlitzel describes we, the
24 ratepayers, do not benefit but will rather be harmed by
25 this plan. The Pleasants plant is not profitable and ---

1 or competitive in Ohio's unregulated market. Dumping it
2 in West Virginia, just as they did with the Harrison
3 plant, will help FirstEnergy's bottom line.

4 It's nothing but a liability for us
5 West Virginia ratepayers who, unless we go off the grid,
6 have no choice about where our power comes from. It's
7 also repugnant that in this day and age of extreme
8 climate events like the two hurricanes we've just
9 witnessed that we persist in this experiment with the
10 pollution emitting, fossil fuel based generation of
11 electricity when science clearly tells us the dangers and
12 risks of persisting with dirty energy.

13 FirstEnergy should be looking at
14 investing in clean energy sources and establishing
15 programs that incentivize and reward energy conservation
16 for customers of all income levels as is the case of
17 power companies in many other states. At the very least
18 it should discontinue plants such as Pleasants.

19 Concerns about job loss have been
20 expressed here tonight, but the economic development in
21 West Virginia can be found in developing alternative
22 energy sources. We ask you, as your mission and vision
23 statement says, to ensure, quote, an improvement in the
24 standard of living and quality of life for the people of
25 West Virginia, end quote. And, quote, that consumers

1 receive the best value in utility service from
2 financially --- for financially viable companies, end
3 quote. This is the mission of the --- the PSC.

4 To my husband and me this means making
5 sure we Potomac Edison customers have a fair day.
6 Forcing ratepayers to buy the outdated, dirty Pleasants
7 plant --- Pleasants plant is contrary of the mission of
8 the PSC. It makes no sense for FirstEnergy to be
9 profitable by placing an unnecessary burden on West
10 Virginia ratepayers. Thank you.

11 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

12 Thank you. Natalie Stone and then
13 Councilman Jim Whitaker is up to next if he wants to.

14 MS. STONE:

15 Commissioner McCabe, my name is Natalie
16 Stone and I'm the Executive Director for the North
17 Central Building Trades Council. The Council urges the
18 Commission during the consideration of this application
19 to keep in mind that year after year the Pleasants power
20 station provides employment to hundreds of local
21 construction workers do their maintenance and outage work
22 providing good wages and benefits to West Virginia
23 families, which is what we thought PSC is governed to do.
24 Thank you for your time.

25 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

1 Thank you. Mr. Whitaker? If not, Ed
2 Zahniser. I'm sure I've butchered that. And then Ed ---
3 okay. Oh, I'm sorry.

4 MR. WHITAKER:

5 I'll say the name.

6 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

7 Okay. Thank you. I apologize, sir.

8 MR. ZAHNISER:

9 No, it's --- Whitaker?

10 MR. WHITAKER:

11 Yeah.

12 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

13 Yes, sir.

14 MR. WHITAKER:

15 Hi. Jim Whitaker with the Berkeley
16 County Council. I'd just like to state that I am here in
17 support of the project with FirstEnergy's endeavors to
18 assume the, I guess the plant. So I'm sure everything's
19 already been said more than once, so I'll just keep it
20 brief and say I'm in support of it. Thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

22 Thank you, sir.

23 MR. ZAHNISER:

24 My name is Edward Zahniser, Z as in
25 zebra, A-H, N as in Nancy, I-S-E-R. I'm a Potomac Edison

1 customer in Jefferson County. First Energy, an out of
2 state company, wants your Commission to force West
3 Virginians to pay for their bad management and planning.
4 Our West Virginia Public Service Commission exists to
5 serve us, not to let out of state companies bilk us to
6 prop up the money losing, outdated, inefficient,
7 polluting coal plant.

8 Cheaper power sources exist.

9 FirstEnergy fails to invest enough in energy efficiency
10 and conservation. Reducing the need for power is the
11 fiscally prudent move. The \$195 million purchase price
12 is ridiculous. The plant is obsolete. The so-called,
13 quote, future power justification is reliably forecast as
14 not needed and that is ipso facto, no justification.

15 The plant's demerits are FirstEnergy
16 management and shareholders' problem and responsibility.
17 Like hedge funds do, FirstEnergy seeks to exploit the
18 marketplace by switcharoo, switching its mordent coal
19 plant between regulated and unregulated markets allowing
20 the company to fleece West Virginia ratepayers.

21 Our Public Service Commission must
22 assure that West Virginia customers not be forced to bail
23 out Ohio based FirstEnergy's pig in a poke. I took up
24 this snafu in person at a Shepherdstown parade earlier
25 this year with West Virginia's Attorney General Patrick

1 Morrissey. The AG later wrote to me and his reply stuck
2 me --- struck me as exceedingly odd, that he could do
3 nothing about FirstEnergy's proposal to fleece West
4 Virginia taxpayers.

5 And why not? The AG said the energy
6 companies are his clients. So you can see why we so
7 earnestly look to you, our Public Service Commission to
8 protect us from this unconscionable, bald face corporate
9 raid on our pocketbooks. And thank you for your time
10 this evening.

11 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

12 Thank you, sir. Regina Hendrix.

13 MS. HENDRIX:

14 Hendrix.

15 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

16 And to be followed by Rebecca Fibst.

17 MS. HENDRIX:

18 I'm going to cut this down because
19 we're so short of time, but can the whole statement go in
20 the record?

21 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

22 You can turn it in, yes.

23 MS. HENDRIX:

24 My name is Regina Hendrix and I'm a
25 resident of Jefferson County since 2009. And I'm here to

1 oppose the Pleasants power plant because first and
2 foremost the FirstEnergy power demand estimate is
3 unsubstantiated and overblown as proven by ex parte
4 witnesses. It guarantees dividends for corporate
5 shareholders at the expense of customers in one of the
6 poorest states in the union.

7 Second, if this purchase is approved,
8 it will delay opportunities for our state to take
9 advantage of cheaper sources of clean power. It
10 guarantees dividends for corporate shareholders at the
11 expense of customers in one of the poorest states in the
12 union, if not the poorest. Third, since my 2009
13 relocation to the Eastern Panhandle I have watched our
14 residential electricity rates increase astronomically, as
15 much as 30 percent. West Virginians cannot afford any
16 more of these increases.

17 We need to protect the ratepayers.
18 After all, our taxpayers are already being taxed to clean
19 up after the extractive industries because of the state's
20 past faulty bonding procedures, which have left taxpayers
21 on the hook. We can't afford any more financial pressure
22 on West Virginia residents. We need to keep the public
23 in our Public Service Commission.

24 You are not the Corporate Service
25 Commission. You have been appointed to protect the

1 public, not the corporate stockholders. And so I'm
2 appealing to Public Service Commissioners and the PSC
3 Consumer Advocate Division, take a look at the 2013
4 acquisition of the Harrison plant and the pain of rate
5 increases and --- rate increases and increased pollution
6 that we have suffered.

7 Please don't let that happen again and
8 thank you for coming to --- to my new home. I've always
9 counted on Brooks and Bill to take up for West Virginians
10 and we are watching.

11 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

12 All right. Thank you. Rebecca Fibst.

13 MS. FIBST:

14 Fibst (corrects pronunciation).

15 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

16 Fibst?

17 MS. FIBST:

18 All right. Rebecca Fibst.

19 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

20 And --- and to be followed by Mandy
21 Staffa I believe. Yes, ma'am.

22 MS. FIBST:

23 Rebecca Fibst. I live in Shepherdstown
24 and it's just such a beautiful state and it's just such a
25 great place to live. And just to say to Public Service

1 Commission people, you --- you're the ones with the
2 power. It's not the electrical utility providers. You
3 have the power to stop this.

4 Don't --- don't lay this --- this awful
5 corporate proposed activity --- don't lay it on the
6 people of West Virginia to --- to cover already ---
7 already so burdened with hard pressed for so many things.
8 Don't --- don't lay it on the people of West Virginia.
9 Don't --- don't let this happen. You're the ones with
10 the power, so do the right thing. Thank you.

11 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

12 Thank you. Mandy Staffa ---

13 MS STAFFA:

14 Yes.

15 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

16 --- to be followed by Robert Fernatt.
17 Again, I'm --- I'm butchering these names and I
18 apologize.

19 MS. STAFFA:

20 Mandy Staffa and my real name is
21 Harriett Staffa. Mandy is a nickname and I'm from
22 Shepherdstown, West Virginia. I've been there since
23 2009. And, Commissioner McCabe, thank you for coming
24 here ---

25 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

1 Thank you.

2 MS. STAFFA:

3 --- to hear us today. I don't want to
4 go and talk about fear because that seems to be the
5 underlying principal going on here. I'm talking about
6 the future and the future of the State of West Virginia.
7 It seems to me that this is an unusual state with
8 extremely independent people living here who have
9 tremendous resilience and resourcefulness.

10 And it seems to me that, as my friend
11 Regina pointed out, unfortunately West Virginia is
12 probably if not the poorest, second to the poorest state
13 in the nation. And I find it absolutely astounding that
14 our rates for electricity are so much more than my
15 neighbor across the river, across the Potomac in
16 Maryland. And we are actually both using Potomac Edison.

17 It's my understanding because I had a
18 little peek at what's going on today, that First Edison
19 being the power company of Mon Energy and Edison, Potomac
20 Edison they're a very large company. In fact, when I was
21 looking at it they are probably the largest electrical
22 company in the United States. And their annual revenue
23 is \$14 and a half billion, which is a huge amount of
24 money.

25 So it seems to me that when you have a

1 company like Potomac Edison charging one rate in West
2 Virginia, another rate in Maryland when in Maryland
3 they're offering quick home energy checkups where they'll
4 send somebody to your house to see how you can save on
5 energy where as in West Virginia they won't do that.
6 They have another program. It's a truly second class
7 program.

8 It seems to me that the company itself
9 is treating the State of West Virginia as a second class
10 state. And I think that it would be so much more
11 creative and so much more positive if First Edison would
12 consider making West Virginia a leader in energy for the
13 country and instead of having us buy a polluting plant,
14 which I'm totally against as you might have guessed by
15 now with what I've been saying.

16 It would make so much more sense for
17 them to invest that kind of money in an alternative
18 energy sources even for us. An example would be going to
19 reach out to companies to come in and invest in West
20 Virginia in alternative energy including the Germans who
21 make the windmill. I mean, I don't see why we have to go
22 backwards as was so beautifully pointed out.

23 I think we can go forwards and turn
24 this state into an example instead of a tragic example
25 where things get dumped when things don't go well. Thank

1 you.

2 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

3 Thank you. Robert Fernatt.

4 MS. STEWARD:

5 What was the name, Commissioner?

6 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

7 Robert Fernatt, F-E-R-N-A-T-T.

8 MS. STEWARD:

9 F-E-R-N-A-T-T.

10 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

11 Okay. Next up after that is Eileen

12 Curfman.

13 MS. STEWARD:

14 Fernatt, he's on his way.

15 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

16 Okay.

17 MR. FERNATT:

18 Hello and good evening, everyone. Just
19 wanted to take a few minutes of your time to express my
20 opinion on the matter, First Energy. I'm a new resident
21 of Berkeley County. Just moved here recently and I am
22 therefore a new customer for Potomac Edison. And I am
23 against the bailout. I'm not looking to raise my energy
24 rates any time soon. I have concerns that we're
25 investing in an older plant that has a series of issues

1 that the coal ash storage and some other items that are a
2 concern.

3 I know we're investing in a time where
4 we're moving forward and we're investing in a technology
5 of the past. So I just wanted to make that note. Thank
6 you.

7 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

8 Thank you, sir. Eileen Curfman.

9 MS. CURFMAN:

10 My name is Eileen Curfman, C-U-R, F as
11 in Frank, M-A-N. I am a lifelong resident of West
12 Virginia and I live in Berkeley County. I've lived in
13 Berkeley County for 33 years now and therefore I'm a
14 customer of Potomac Edison.

15 I believe that the Pleasants power
16 plant relies on something very outmoded coal. It's
17 dirty, there's less and less of it all the time. There
18 are more and more miners out of work because there's less
19 and less coal to mine. Making this Pleasants power plant
20 make money is probably impossible or FirstEnergy would
21 not be looking to dump it in West Virginia.

22 I feel that the customers are going to
23 end up spending more for their electric bills in order to
24 pay for this mistake and that our money can be spent on
25 projects that bring us clean, efficient energy and these

1 projects would also create a lot of new jobs in expanding
2 industries like solar and wind energy that would give our
3 young people an actual future instead of having to hang
4 on to the few coal jobs that remain.

5 The Public Service Commission's role is
6 to do what is best for the people of West Virginia and I
7 urge the Commission not to approve this transfer of the
8 Pleasants power plant to Mon Power and Potomac Edison.

9 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

10 Thank you, ma'am. Cecil Claude and
11 she'll be followed by Charlotte Brown.

12 MS. CLAUDE:

13 Yes. Hello. My name is Cecil Claude.

14 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

15 Cecil. Sorry.

16 MS. CLAUDE:

17 That's all right. C-L-A-U-D-E. And
18 I'm going to read this from a friend also. So to whom it
19 may concern, I stand opposed to the proposed sale and
20 transfer of an old, obsolete and dirty coal plant that
21 was once a producer for neighboring Ohio and owned by the
22 same company where Ohio got all the power and we in West
23 Virginia got all the exhaust and smoke and particles also
24 known as the Pleasants power plant.

25 With this proposed deal in front of the

1 PSC, we get the power and the pollution to the detriment
2 of renewable energy project developments statewide and
3 shows a lack of diversity in our state's energy mix. If
4 we are to compete as a state to reduce carbon intensity
5 due to the dangers and impact of climate change how can
6 we possibly accomplish that by taking in an old coal
7 plant known to be the highest emitter of CO2 than
8 anything else out there on the power market today?

9 We should be considering newer and
10 cleaner power sources that include a balance of competing
11 prices for power that demand response including
12 renewables that produce during peak periods where power
13 is more expensive on the open market. Solar and wind
14 compete with coal and gas and modern battery technology
15 allows for safe and reliable storage of that energy
16 during periods of oversupply.

17 West Virginia PSC should not allow this
18 plan to go through, but encourage solar energy system
19 development statewide. This would provide jobs and bring
20 in much needed high tech business to our state that pays
21 higher wages and provides good benefits to the workers
22 and their families.

23 We can develop our electric vehicle
24 charging infrastructure so that state residences can
25 easily travel throughout West Virginia and obtain the

1 necessarily --- necessary fuel charge to make it from
2 Huntingdon to Harpers Ferry, a win, win for the electric
3 utilities and the residents.

4 I would urge the PSC to look hard and
5 long at this terrible deal for ratepayers and taxpayers
6 who rely on clean air and water to sustain good health
7 and raise healthy families. We already have enough coal
8 powered plants in our state and the utility did not prove
9 the need for more of that type of source. With gas and
10 solar storage we won't be needing anymore older coal
11 plants in our state. Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

13 Thank you. Charlotte Brown to be
14 followed by Senator Craig Blair. Charlotte Brown.

15 MS. STEWARD:

16 Charlotte brown? She had to step out
17 for a minute. Senator?

18 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

19 Senator Blair.

20 SENATOR BLAIR:

21 Good evening. My name's Craig Blair,
22 C-R-A-I-G. Blair, B-L-A-I-R. First of all, welcome to
23 the Eastern Panhandle. I hope you enjoyed that five hour
24 drive. I know I do and everything. And before I get
25 going for --- I better get some disclaimers out here.

1 Number one is is that I have served in
2 the legislator with Mr. Brooks McCabe here and he's
3 absolutely wonderful to work with. And he's been great
4 to work with through the Public Service Commission when I
5 was chairing governmental, organizational on the Senate
6 side. And by the way, everybody speaking here today I am
7 glad I waited 'til August 27 so I could get to hear the
8 different perspectives from the people out here.

9 So --- and --- and that's always a good
10 thing. I'm from Hedgesville. I represent the 15
11 senatorial district, which is parts of Berkeley County
12 and Merrill County and all of Morgan and Hampshire
13 County. I'm a long-time businessman and a legislator, as
14 I've just spoken about, and I've seen when the government
15 gets in the way of good business and this transaction is
16 pretty obviously good business. Okay?

17 The Public Service Commission should
18 allow Mon Power to buy the Pleasants power plant because
19 it preserves good jobs. West Virginia coal will be used
20 there, lower electricity rates to our customers
21 throughout the state. It's a good deal on what's going
22 on. Now, I've heard a little bit of talk here tonight
23 and I'm all about clean energy as well. A whole
24 portfolio.

25 This is what we need to have in West

1 Virginia so that we got consistent. I've visited a coal
2 power plant a couple years ago and I was amazed at how
3 clean it was, but the thing I was more amazed about was
4 is that the amount of coal that was sitting in the
5 stockyard. And I said, how many days of power will that
6 provide? And they told me something like 45.

7 You can't do that with sun, you can't
8 do that with natural gas, you can't do that with anything
9 other than nuclear and we all know that nuclear has its
10 own risks going with it, but coal has the ability to able
11 to prevent both blackouts and brown outs.

12 And I think the Public Service
13 Commission's responsibility more than anything is to make
14 sure that we have consistent energy in the State of West
15 Virginia for not just the people, but for businesses that
16 create the jobs. And then when you're using that coal
17 you're also keeping some miners at work as well. Now,
18 that's the way that I'd like to see the Public Service
19 Commission go.

20 So as you can tell, I am a supporter
21 wholeheartedly of this transaction because I believe it
22 will actually make it so that we have a broad portfolio
23 in West Virginia for energy needs. Thank you very much
24 and thank you for being here.

25 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

1 Thank you. Charlotte Brown.

2 MS. BROWN:

3 My name is Charlotte Brown and I ---
4 I'm not against the transaction, but I would like to see
5 that the transaction comes along with a stipulation that
6 there will be no rate hike to us as West Virginians for a
7 period of at least five years as a result of this
8 transition of --- you know, of the company to a
9 subsidiary. Thank you.

10 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

11 Danny Lutz is next up to be followed by
12 Council President Douglas Copenhaver.

13 MR. LUTZ:

14 Commissioner, will you indulge me to
15 speak from here so I don't have to be ---?

16 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

17 No --- no problem.

18 MR. LUTZ:

19 Thank you. My name is Danny Lutz
20 spelled L as in Lima, U as in Uniform, T as in Tango, Z
21 as in Zulu and for some of the speakers here have to say.
22 It's just another four letter word. I'm from Jefferson
23 County. At first I'm dismayed that your other two
24 colleagues elected not to show up here in the Eastern
25 Panhandle and sent you to face the music alone. Second,

1 the essential elements of the Sunshine Law in West
2 Virginia require that such meetings as this be held in a
3 venue of sufficient size to accommodate all who wish to
4 attend and be heard. Why wasn't this done?

5 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

6 I hear you. Continue.

7 MR. LUTZ:

8 Now, I --- I'm not going to reiterate
9 what other people have said about the negative elements
10 of this transaction. Instead I'm going to suggest a
11 solution or at least try to.

12 Instead of soaking the West Virginia
13 ratepayers for almost \$200 million in a boon doggel, why
14 not put this and the Bath plant and whichever other ones
15 that are intending to slide in in the future, put these
16 into a real estate investment trust and see what salvage
17 value and then make your money off of the --- the
18 electricity you generate.

19 Do that through computer program
20 trading on the commodities market. That's 21st Century
21 gentlemen, not say, oh, we got to keep coal jobs. Now,
22 within ten years Harrison, Fort Martin, Well Island,
23 Pleasants and keep naming them are going to have fewer
24 jobs for everybody because the operation of these plants
25 will be automated. Where you got a hundred people

1 working now, you'll have ten working in ten years. That
2 ain't a good future folks.

3 Further the ash pile's been discussed
4 some. In that ash pile are rare earth elements from West
5 Virginia coal and the shales that surround it. Some of
6 the elements if recovered would be worth \$20,000 a
7 kilogram, which is what we're paying on the world market
8 to places such as China and Afghanistan that don't
9 exactly bear us goodwill.

10 Why are we not recovering these
11 elements from West Virginia? That makes jobs for people
12 who were once doing coal the same loader operator,
13 operating engineer, electrician who is taking the
14 mountains apart can pick up the same awful and take it to
15 a plant to have it centrifuged to recover these elements.
16 Why isn't West Virginia doing this?

17 Further, within --- between now and
18 2020 China and/or India will come online with a molten
19 salt nuclear reactor generating electricity. Now, this
20 plant, this reactor --- it is nuclear, runs on thorium,
21 which is in abundance in West Virginia. And a plant ---
22 a generator the size of Modessa where the Consumer
23 Advocate and the counsel are sitting could power a city
24 the size of Martinsburg. That's 21st Century, not what
25 we're hearing here about, oh, a real estate shuffle.

1 Finally, we have got to get away from
2 this whetted fossil fuels. For instance, the Harrison
3 plant when it was sold FirstEnergy entered into a coal
4 contract to buy coal for then 27 years at \$150 plus per
5 ton. Now, I asked Charlie Frivolen December of 2015 what
6 are you doing about this bad deal? He say, well, we're
7 trying to renegotiate that. Boy, that sounded like good
8 business sense to me.

9 So finally I wish the Commission would
10 consider these options instead of just a rubber stamp on
11 a bad public policy decision. Thank you kindly.

12 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

13 Thank you, sir.

14 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

15 Let's keep the --- let's keep the
16 for/against clapping down so we can move forward.

17 MR. LUTZ:

18 Hey, my relatives came. What can I
19 say?

20 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

21 The --- the next up is Douglas
22 Copenhaver and to be followed by John Rosenberger.

23 MR. COPENHAVER:

24 Hello, Commissioner. My name is Doug
25 Copenhaver, C-O-P-E-N-H-A-V-E-R. I'm the President of

1 Berkeley County Council. Which you know as a Commission,
2 here in Berkeley County, and Jefferson and Morgan County
3 just in the Eastern Panhandle, there's over 200,000
4 residents.

5 If we had a room large enough to hold
6 --- I don't think there's any room here that we could
7 hold 200,000 people. And so there's a lot of the
8 majority of the people out there that may not be here
9 tonight that supports this --- this purchase of this
10 power plant. One of my jobs is to make sure that we're
11 able to create activity and create jobs in Berkeley
12 County.

13 That's being done in Berkeley County
14 and --- and Morgan County and also in Jefferson County
15 right now. We're attracting for the first time for West
16 Virginia in a long time, if ever in the history, of
17 attracting Fortune 500 companies here. The Eastern
18 Panhandle is the backbone of the economy of the State of
19 West Virginia. One of the things that these large
20 industrial companies look for is dependability,
21 reliability of all energy resources, gas, natural gas,
22 power and everything like that.

23 So with the --- with the purchase of
24 the power plant we would be able to make it dependable,
25 sustainable; it's very important for us here in the

1 county.

2 The Development Authority feels it's
3 very --- very important for them to keep attracting
4 clients and so not only is it going to save the jobs that
5 the power plant already has through the coal and
6 everything else, but it's also going to bring new
7 opportunities to Berkeley County and also be able to keep
8 reasonable rates on our energy when it comes to power.

9 We know in our local --- across the
10 state bounds of the border here East Alcoa left the State
11 of Maryland because energy became --- power became too
12 --- too expensive. So they moved to Canada. I think
13 this merger is something that need --- not --- the
14 purchase needs to go forward and I encourage you to do
15 so. Thank you for your time.

16 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

17 Thank you, Commissioner. John
18 Rosenberger is up now to be followed by Chris Craig.

19 MR. ROSENBERGER:

20 Hi. My name is John Rosenberger. I'm
21 with the North Central West Virginia Building and
22 Construction Trades Council. I'd like to ask the
23 Commission when reviewing this application to keep in
24 mind the jobs, and workers and families benefit from
25 these jobs that are provided by these plants. Thank you.

1 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

2 Thank you, sir. Chris Craig is up now
3 to be followed by Tracey Cannon.

4 MR. CRAIG:

5 My name is Chris Craig, C-R-A-I-G. I'm
6 from Harpers Ferry, part-time teacher and part time in
7 the tourist industry. I speak tonight to express my
8 opposition to the transfer of the Pleasants coal-powered
9 plant and its financial burden to the energy ratepayers
10 of West Virginia.

11 Today coal-powered energy is the
12 dwindling energy source in the U.S. for several reasons
13 and its cost is expected to increase over the coming
14 years. In spite of calculated denial in both state and
15 federal governments there is no such thing as clean coal.
16 The mining has marred our mountains and has citified our
17 streams.

18 The emissions have been linked to
19 thousands of premature deaths, raised asthma and other
20 respiratory ailment rates among our children and
21 contributed to making West Virginia one of the
22 unhealthiest states in the nation. Coal's contribution
23 to global warming is unmatched even among other fossil
24 fuels. Yes, the coal industry has historically
25 contributed greatly to our state, but that contribution

1 has dwindled rapidly and coal country has long been the
2 poorest part of West Virginia.

3 Now First Energy is attempting to
4 transfer an unprofitable, dirty plant from one subsidiary
5 to another so the ratepayers of West Virginia can bail
6 them out of their own unwise investments and outdated
7 technology. This follows a similar transfer of the
8 Harrison power station in 2013, that according to the
9 institute for energy economics and financial analysis,
10 cost customers more than \$160 million.

11 They say that the power produced is
12 needed for the growing demand in future West Virginia,
13 but I question if a less healthy West Virginia burdened
14 by the resulting increased rates will experience growing
15 demand instead of continued population decline and loss
16 of business.

17 Instead of the increased rates required
18 to bail out the Pleasants plant could we have a much
19 smaller rate increase that could help finance energy
20 efficiency programs and boost the growth of green energy
21 in our state including solar, wind, geothermal and
22 biomass sources, growing demands for these new industries
23 would in the long run lead to more jobs, a less
24 centralized and safer grid and a cleaner West Virginia.
25 Thank you for considering my comments in your decision on

1 this important topic and, again, I urge you to deny the
2 transfer.

3 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

4 Thank you, sir. Tracey Cannon to be
5 followed by Consuelo Newman I believe.

6 MS. CANNON:

7 Hi.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

9 Yes.

10 MS. CANNON:

11 Thank you very much for hearing us,
12 Commissioner. My name is Tracey Cannon and I live in
13 Hedgesville, West Virginia. I'm protesting the purchase
14 of the Pleasants power plant by FirstEnergy, which would
15 adversely affect Potomac Edison customers. As a citizen
16 of West Virginia and a customer of FirstEnergy, this
17 proposal by FirstEnergy is not in my best interest.

18 I'm requesting that the proposal be
19 rejected by Governor Jim Justice and the Public Service
20 Commission per the stated public mission and vision
21 statement of the Commission members mandate to provide an
22 increase in business investment, job creation retention
23 and the state's overall competitiveness. An improvement
24 in the standard of living and quality of life for people
25 of West Virginia. That consumers receive the best value

1 and utility service from financially viable and
2 technically competitive companies.

3 That utilities receive an opportunity
4 to earn a fair return on their investment in regulated
5 services. Based on a review of the above criteria, the
6 proposed FirstEnergy purchase of the Pleasants power
7 plant does not meet these standards. It is estimated
8 that a FirstEnergy investment of \$195 million would
9 provide approximately 4,000 jobs in energy efficiency and
10 renewable energy career --- career employment.

11 Cathy Kunkel reported the average wage
12 for these energy efficiency jobs is nearly \$5,000 above
13 the national median income. The number of median income
14 jobs for our citizens with an investment purchase of the
15 37 year old coal fire --- fired Pleasants power plant is
16 not adequately comparable.

17 The purchase would decrease rather than
18 increase West Virginia's competitiveness with states with
19 energy efficiency resource standards such as Maryland,
20 Ohio, Pennsylvania and New Jersey, which require
21 investments in energy savings programs from FirstEnergy.
22 The Public Service Commission would benefit West Virginia
23 citizens by requiring similar standards from electric
24 utility companies. Additionally there is no improvement
25 in the standard of living or quality of life for the

1 people of West Virginia with the proposed purchase of the
2 Pleasants power station due to the economic loss from the
3 lack of investment and energy efficiency and renewable
4 energy sources.

5 Furthermore, the Pleasants power
6 station is responsible for negative health incomes of
7 West Virginia citizens and adverse impact on state
8 environmental resources. The Pleasants power plant is
9 cited for 40 deaths, 65 heart attacks, 630 asthma
10 attacks, 30 hospital admissions and 32 asthma ER visits
11 in 2014 as evidenced by the clean air taskforce study in
12 2014.

13 Moreover, consumers are not receiving
14 the best value in utility service from FirstEnergy due to
15 their failure to provide similar energy savings programs
16 that they provide in neighboring states, specifically
17 Maryland, Ohio, Pennsylvania and New Jersey. Customers
18 in these states benefit from customer energy savings
19 repay discounts and appliance turn in programs.

20 The Governor and Public Service
21 Commission of West Virginia are entrusted with
22 safeguarding the quality of life for West Virginians for
23 decades to come. I urge the Commission to protect my
24 interests and those of the rest of the state by rejecting
25 the proposed Pleasants power plant transfer by

1 FirstEnergy onto the backs of struggling citizens and
2 customers. Thank you.

3 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

4 Thank you. Consuelo Newman followed by
5 Maggie Loudin. Yes, ma'am.

6 MS. NEWMAN:

7 Good evening, Mr. McCabe. Thank you
8 for being here. My name is Consuelo Newman. I'm a
9 resident of Martinsburg. Four years ago we were at
10 similar crossroads as we are today. At that time
11 FirstEnergy claimed that we would need more power inside
12 the Eastern Panhandle. With an inefficient coal-fired
13 power plant nearly 40 years old more toxic to the
14 environment than all the other of West Virginia's then
15 current power plants.

16 The paltry sum of \$560 million of which
17 \$165,000 million has now been paid. Astonishingly almost
18 the exact same scenario presents itself today. We're
19 told that we shall need additional electricity by next
20 year and that we should buy another 38 year old highly
21 inefficient power plant. This time this plant which will
22 only cost \$195 million comes with five times more sulfur
23 dioxide, nitrous oxide, heavy metals and particulate
24 matter than all other power plants in West Virginia put
25 together.

1 Forty (40) deaths, 65 heart attacks,
2 630 asthma attacks and countless other cases of
3 allergies, emphysema and other ailments have been
4 attributed to this power plant by some studies. Do we
5 really want to be responsible for becoming the caretakers
6 of this responsibility? What are the other real costs of
7 this albatross, which could not be sold anywhere else
8 except to compliant West Virginia?

9 Haven't we had enough of being stuck
10 with corporate refuse? Are we not willing to make sound
11 business decisions without being swayed by corporate and
12 political expediency? Are we to be swayed by every
13 company that dangles the carrot of jobs being given or it
14 being taken away? We do not need this plant. We're able
15 to purchase electricity at any time from the grid if we
16 should need it.

17 The plant is already in West Virginia
18 and employs West Virginians. A matter that never seems
19 to be discussed is that the only one of FirstEnergy six
20 states that are regulated should we be forced to purchase
21 this power plant to be stuck with its bills for decades
22 to come? This plant which already has reached the end of
23 its effective life is being rammed down our throats
24 because it is an excellent business decision for
25 FirstEnergy.

1 None of the other five states in its
2 stable will be buying a single coal-fired power plant and
3 FirstEnergy bragged about that point in its 2014 annual
4 report. If the Public Service Commission chooses to
5 allow FirstEnergy and its affiliates to do this travesty
6 against the ratepayers of Allegheny and Mon Power, it is
7 estimated that the actual expense will be closer to \$400
8 million than to \$195 million.

9 Although we would be forced to pay the
10 bills, we would have no say whatsoever in how the plant
11 would be managed, and to the extent that if management
12 chooses, it could decommission the plant at any time
13 leaving us with the bills, and no jobs and without a
14 viable power plant, yet with a full stable of expenses
15 including clean up, environmental costs and hook payments
16 to those whose health has already been compromised by
17 this power plant and for future injured parties.

18 What benefits do we get from this
19 decision? Absolutely none. We get financial expenses, a
20 liability, increased monthly payments to the electric
21 company and no guarantee whatsoever that the power plant
22 will even be operational ten years from now when we will
23 still be paying its bills.

24 What will FirstEnergy and its
25 affiliates receive? \$190 million guaranteed by tens of

1 thousands of rate paying customers, the illumination of
2 another old, inefficient and highly toxic power plant, an
3 improvement of its energy efficiency phase and portfolio
4 and the elimination of a non-performing asset. There are
5 no good reasons for us to be taking on this expense,
6 none, and if this were not enough there's another reason
7 why we shouldn't do this.

8 We need to eliminate the pipeline
9 whereby every few years FirstEnergy through its
10 subsidiaries will be attempting to download one after
11 another coal-fired power plant to seemingly, endlessly
12 ignorant and powerless West Virginians. We the citizens
13 are asking the Public Service Commission to end this
14 travesty now.

15 FirstEnergy has the highest paid
16 executive of its type not only in the United States, but
17 in the entire hemisphere, North and South America. When
18 we won our lawsuit against FirstEnergy a few years ago we
19 were rewarded by being stuck with an increase of seven
20 percent in great part to cover the expenses of the suit
21 which FirstEnergy had lost. The Public Service
22 Commission authorized the increase as it authorized the
23 purchase of the other power plant.

24 It is our --- your fiduciary
25 responsibility to protect us from the abuses of those in

1 control of the electric monopoly in our region. We are
2 simply asking that you take our side on this issue
3 because although we pay everyone's salary we have very
4 little say or sway in how this will go. We are asking
5 that you do the right thing and say no to the FirstEnergy
6 in denying the purchase of the Pleasants power plant.
7 Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

9 Thank you. Maggie Loudin and Andrea
10 Singer may want to --- may want to make some comments.
11 Yeah, there was a question mark. I'm not sure on him.
12 Yes, ma'am.

13 MS. LOUDIN:

14 Okay. Good evening. Thank you. Much
15 of what I have to say I think everybody is aware of in
16 this room, but I will say it anyway. First I implore the
17 Public Service Commission to reject this particular
18 request by FirstEnergy to --- to transfer one of its
19 power --- one of its power plants, coal power plants to
20 another subsidiary.

21 FirstEnergy is one of the two major
22 electric utility companies in West Virginia and parent of
23 its subsidiaries there are Mon Power and First --- and
24 Potomac Edison. And I am a ratepayer of Potomac Edison.
25 It has come to you again, the West Virginia Public

1 Service Commission, and this is the second time seeking
2 permission to have Mon Power purchase a coal-fired power
3 plant from another of its subsidiaries, Allegheny Energy
4 Supply.

5 In 2013 you --- the Public Service
6 Commission allowed Mon Power to --- which is a utility
7 power plant in the regulated state namely West Virginia
8 to --- to buy 79.46 percent of the coal-fired 1984
9 megawatt Harrison's power plant, which was owned ---
10 which was owned by Allegheny Energy Supply in Ohio, which
11 is a regulated state.

12 The argument that swayed you on the
13 Public Service Commission to allow the transfer between
14 the two subsidiaries of First Energy was that the public
15 interest would be served. Instead estimates published by
16 the Institute for Energy Economics and Financial Analysis
17 document re-regulating coal plants in West Virginia by
18 Cathy Kunkel showed that consumers have lost more than
19 \$160 million relative to what they would have otherwise
20 paid for electricity.

21 If the Public Service Commission
22 approves the purchase of Pleasants power plant, West
23 Virginia ratepayers will see an increase in their utility
24 bills. Under the current ownership structure, Allegheny
25 Energy Supply makes a profit or loss based on whether the

1 revenues obtained from selling the plant's electricity
2 covers the cost of owning and operating the plant.

3 However, if the plant is transferred to
4 Mon Power and Potomac Edison in the regulated State of
5 West Virginia, the cost of the plant including profit to
6 FirstEnergy will be paid by consumers --- excuse me, by
7 ratepayers. We will pay more to cover less. It seems
8 clear that FirstEnergy thought this plant was actually
9 going to keep making strong profits FirstEnergy would
10 keep it under the current ownership structure.

11 I am an environmentalist as well as a
12 ratepayer to FirstEnergy and I ask the Public Service
13 Commission to reject FirstEnergy's petition. Thank you
14 very much.

15 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

16 Andrew Singer? We'll move on to
17 Barbara Bergman to be followed by Jane Butler.

18 MS. BERGMAN:

19 My name is Barbara Bergman,
20 B-E-R-G-M-A-N. And I'm a resident of Jefferson County
21 and Potomac Edison is my electric company. I'm speaking
22 to urge the West Virginia Public Service Commission to
23 reject FirstEnergy, Mon Power and Potomac Edison's
24 proposal to purchase 100 percent of the Pleasants power
25 plant. This proposal allows the company's customers to

1 pay \$195 million to Allegheny Energy Supply Company, a
2 subsidiary already owned by FirstEnergy.

3 This is an outrageous accounting
4 sleight of hand to benefit FirstEnergy executive salaries
5 more than West Virginia ratepayers and state tax
6 revenues. The Public Service Commission should require
7 Mon Power and Potomac Edison to invest in energy
8 efficiency and renewable energy, which would cost less
9 than half the amount of power generated by the Pleasants
10 power station, with lower health costs and environmental
11 degradation.

12 Economic studies have shown the
13 following and this is from U.S. News and World Report,
14 March 17th issue in the commentary section. Right now
15 America's solar industry employs nearly 209,000 workers
16 compared to about 150,000 jobs remaining in the domestic
17 coal industry. A study published in the journal Energy
18 Economics found that the growth of solar related
19 employment could absorb coal industry layoffs and provide
20 full-time careers for coal workers during the next 15
21 years.

22 After retraining the study concluded
23 salaries for technical workers in the solar industry
24 would surpass the money they made working in coal.

25 Instead of agreeing with the company's

1 analysis that is purchasing an affiliated company that is
2 benefiting West Virginia ratepayers and our tax base the
3 Public Service Commission should require Mon Power and
4 Potomac Edison to ramp up their energy efficiency and
5 renewable energy efforts in West Virginia which are
6 currently ranked one of the lowest in the country. This
7 will ensure that any projected energy capacity shortfall
8 would be met satisfactorily for decades to come. Thank
9 you.

10 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

11 Thank you. Jane Butler to be followed
12 by Claudia Orr.

13 MS. BUTLER:

14 Hi. My name is Jane Butler and I've
15 lived in Hedgesville, West Virginia for the last 30
16 years. Thank you for coming down here tonight and
17 listening to all of us.

18 FirstEnergy, the parent company of
19 Monongahela Power and Potomac Edison wants its West
20 Virginia ratepayers to bail out one of its struggling
21 coal-fired power plants currently owned by one of
22 FirstEnergy's deregulated Ohio subsidiaries, Allegheny
23 Energy Supply, the Pleasants power station is failing to
24 compete against less expensive power sources in that
25 market. On December 16th, 2016, Mon Power submitted a

1 request for proposals RFP for 1,300 megawatts of
2 generation capacity.

3 It was no coincidence that the
4 Pleasants plant would uniquely qualify. On March 7th,
5 2017, Mon Power and Potomac Edison submitted a formal
6 request to the Public Service Commission to purchase the
7 Pleasants plant. In West Virginia's regulated utility
8 market Mon Power is guaranteed a positive rate of return.

9 This means that West Virginia
10 ratepayers would be forced to pay for more coal-fired
11 power generation instead of cheaper alternatives. In
12 October 2013, the PSC approved a similar transfer when
13 Mon Power purchased --- purchased a 79.46 percent share
14 of the coal-fired 1984 megawatt Harrison power station
15 from Allegheny Energy Supply.

16 Mon Power argued that this was in the
17 public interest, but instead estimates by the Institute
18 for Energy Economics and Financial Analysis showed that
19 customers have lost more than \$160 million relative to
20 what they would have otherwise paid for electricity.
21 FirstEnergy submitted an integrated resource plan or IRP
22 to the West Virginia Public Service Commission integrated
23 resource planning is a process by which utilities
24 determine the mix of resources they will use to meet
25 projected demand for electricity at the lowest possible

1 cost to consumers.

2 The IRP submitted by FirstEnergy
3 predicts extensive demand growth and a shortfall of
4 generation capacity within this year, but considers very
5 few energy efficiency programs. FirstEnergy's IRP
6 justifies a power plant transfer based on a predicted 850
7 megawatt shortfall in generating capacity in the coming
8 decade, but that shortfall only occurs if FirstEnergy
9 actually sees electricity demand grow by more than two
10 percent each year. Thank you.

11 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

12 Thank you. Claudia Orr followed by
13 former Delegate Walter Duke.

14 MS. ORR:

15 My name's Claudia Orr. I'm a resident
16 of Jefferson County and I'm here to request that the
17 Commission reject the proposal to buy the Pleasants
18 plant. The issue I want to speak to is the \$45 million
19 closing fee for the coal ash impoundment. My
20 understanding that this figure reflects that the closing
21 of the impoundment will go perfectly.

22 So I urge the Commission to inquire and
23 look into what happens if it doesn't go perfectly? What
24 will be the costs and how will that be planned for?
25 There is a precedent here for the Commission. The

1 initial plant was transferred from AEP, AEP is an Ohio
2 affiliate, to the Appalachian Power. And the liability
3 and ownership of the coal ash impoundment or dump was ---
4 was --- the plant was sold separately from the coal ash
5 impoundment. And I'd like the Commission to consider
6 that.

7 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

8 Thank you. Delegate Duke.

9 MR. DUKE:

10 My name is --- I'm a former Delegate.
11 I'm not a Delegate anymore. Walter Duke, W-A-L-T-E-R,
12 D-U-K-E. And I'm here as a taxpayer and a ratepayer.
13 The information that was presented to you all I was
14 unable to hear because I was out in the hall, but I do
15 want to welcome the Public Service Commission here to
16 hold the hearings.

17 As a result of the hearing you all make
18 the decision and I'm here to speak in favor of the
19 decision to transfer the asset the Pleasants facility.
20 I've served in legislature and elective service in 2016,
21 but during that time I saw a number of counties that came
22 to this state because they had been decimated. I saw
23 county school systems come to this state because they had
24 been decimated.

25 This plant provides a couple hundred

1 good paying jobs, it provides tremendous property taxes
2 both to the county government and the county in which
3 it's situated as well as the county school system. The
4 fact is that Mon Power has a shortage anticipated in
5 generation capacity this would provide that. It would
6 help those people there.

7 It would help provide the electricity
8 and Mon Power has about 540,000 customers including about
9 140,000 Potomac Edison customers here. With our growth,
10 with --- with different industry capacity that's come
11 online and soon to come online we are going to be needing
12 that extra capacity as well. So I would urge you to
13 accept it. Thank you.

14 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

15 Thank you, sir. Helen Claire Grisell.

16 MS. GRISELL:

17 I'm not going to walk too far. I
18 didn't plan on speaking this evening, however, after
19 hearing Mr. Copenhaver speak I --- I couldn't sit still
20 very long. I think I found my new best friend, Mr. Lutz.
21 I love you.

22 MR. LUTZ:

23 Probably the only one.

24 MS. GRISELL:

25 Huh? Did you say that? No, you were

1 wonderful. I recently did a study on the environment in
2 --- in green energy and 200 jobs. Well, --- with the
3 coal industry. Well, howdy do. Let me tell you. Google
4 Cisco Systems, Kohl's, Amazon, Microsoft, they are the
5 top companies in the United States and I'm pulling this
6 off the top of my head from the studies that I just
7 recently have done for another issue that's coming up
8 here in West Virginia.

9 And they are trying to be self-
10 sufficient and bring self-sufficiency all across the
11 United States to corporations. So when you say that,
12 when Mr. Copenhaver kind of stated, oh, yeah, but this
13 will bring business. Big business, Fortune 500
14 companies, they are building and when they build they are
15 now building their buildings to be solar-powered, and
16 self-sufficient.

17 Kohl's. Everybody here knows there's a
18 Kohl's over in --- I think --- I don't know. I don't ---
19 Charles Town. Okay. So there's a Kohl's --- let me just
20 tell you about Kohl's. Every Kohl's department store ---
21 and if you shop at one, you're shopping in one that's 50
22 percent solar-powered for their energy and the rest
23 probably is a little natural gas is being provided, but
24 if Kohl's had their way, they would have that provided
25 fully provided. Kohl's is --- is on their way to be

1 self-sufficient.

2 So these big corporations are out there
3 to be green. They do not want coal. For God's sake
4 people, come into the 21st Century. I am hot-headed and
5 madder than the wet hen. That's an old expression and I
6 know y'all know it, and coal is out. And I mean, there's
7 coalminers, poor souls. Get them educated, get them new
8 jobs. And you know what?

9 The poor teachers in this state --- I
10 worked with a teacher this summer on a play. The two of
11 us were in a play together and she has to hold down
12 another job because her pay for being a teacher here in
13 West Virginia is so poor that she has to have another job
14 just to be able to --- to live.

15 So come on. The politicians in this
16 state, why aren't you paying --- why aren't you paying
17 your teachers? So let's not waste money on this -- this
18 thing, this mess that you want to waste your money on.
19 Let's not do it. I say no. Reject it, keep the money,
20 pay the teachers, teach the coalminers.

21 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

22 I --- I --- I believe that's the last
23 of our speakers.

24 MS. GRISELL:

25 I was the last one.

1 COMMISSIONER MCCABE:

2 That's the last word. Is there anyone
3 else that has not signed up? I would like to thank
4 everybody for being here, you know, in a room that was
5 overcrowded, too warm. You all stayed with it. The
6 presenters did a wonderful job and we all thank you.
7 This is a difficult issue and this public hearing has
8 been very helpful.

9 We'd like to point out that the
10 evidentiary hearing will be held on September 26th, 9:30
11 and we'll continue through the 28th if --- if necessary.
12 That --- that evidentiary hearing will be held in
13 Charleston at the Public Service Commission on Brooks
14 Street.

15 Members of the public may attend the
16 hearing in Charleston or may view the proceeding over the
17 Commission's live webcast of that hearing, but we will
18 not --- we will not be taking public comment at that
19 time. The Commission will continue to receive written
20 public comments in this case or through our website,
21 which is www.PSC.state.wv.us or at our address, which is
22 the Public Service Commission, 201 Brooks Street,
23 Charleston, West Virginia.

24 This has been a very helpful evening
25 and really appreciate everyone speaking clearly and

1 within reasonable time frames, and particularly
2 appreciate you all staying around. We will have the
3 members from the utility and the Staff and CAD here
4 afterwards if there are any --- any particular questions,
5 but we thank you again.

6 And this is important. We really do
7 listen and just want you to know that --- that your time
8 has been well spent this evening. Thank you all.

9
10 * * * * *

11 HEARING CONCLUDED AT 8:46 P.M.

12 * * * * *

13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

I certify that the attached transcript meets the requirements set forth within article twenty-seven, chapter forty-seven of the West Virginia Code.



Court Reporter